



Naila Mushtaq<sup>1</sup>, Shama Suleman<sup>2</sup>, Abdul Qayyum<sup>3</sup>

## Abstract

The purpose of this study is to give evidence that sheds light on the complexities of data privacy problems in mobile banking within the setting of Pakistan. Trust plays a vital role, which is linked with socio-cultural dynamics, user experience, and regulatory knowledge, according to the results of a thematic analysis of in-depth interviews and focus group discussions from various ranges of participants. In light of these findings, it is imperative that financial institutions modify their mobile banking services so that they are in line with the values of the local community, place notable importance on open and honest communication, and adjust to the regulatory landscape. Although the findings contribute to the improvement of security and the promotion of self-confidence in Karachi's digital economic environment, it is very important to recognize the limits of the study, which include the qualitative character of the research and the possibility of selection bias.

**Keywords:** Mobile Banking, Trust, Socio-Cultural Dynamics, Data Privacy Concerns, User Experience, Regulatory Awareness

## 1. Introduction

Our lives are now bound up in the web of innovation, which is itself a product of the dynamic field of technology and innovation (Akram et al., 2021; Audi et al., 2021). The domain of communication is one of the most important areas in which technology has had a significant influence. The days of depending just on snail mail or landlines are over. A brand-new era of immediate connectedness has begun with the introduction of the internet and mobile gadgets of all kinds. The use of prompt messaging, video conferencing, and social media has grown seamlessly in our everyday lives (Abdelrady & Akram, 2022). Technology has also become a game-changer in the domain of education among other fields. There are other ways to get an education without sitting in a classroom (Akram & Abdelrady, 2023). By removing physical obstacles and making educational capitals available to people from all over the world, online learning has democratized access to information (Al-Adwan et al., 2022). Intricate and innovative ideas are now more reachable and interesting to learn about thanks to interactive imitations and augmented reality apps. Social media enhances motivation to communicate and learn (Ramzan et al., 2023; Audi et al., 2022).

From the manner in which we communicate to the manner in which we carry out financial transactions, technology plays a vital role in determining the outlines of our day-to-day lives, therefore creating a dynamic and interwoven tapestry that defines the contemporary period. Technology is more than a tool; it is a revolutionary force that has rewired our whole existence due to its immense effect. The concept of data privacy has been receiving a growing amount of attention in this digital age, particularly in the field of mobile banking (Tam & Oliveira, 2017). This is because ease and complexity frequently go hand in hand in this era.

The availability of smartphones has primarily altered the way in which we handle our financial matters and dealing. In addition to being a handy choice, mobile banking has become an essential service for a lot of people. While it's great to be able to see our account balances, send money, and make payments with a few taps on our devices, it's vital to keep the data that supports these activities secure (Thusi & Maduku, 2020).

In light of this, the article's featured qualitative research delves additional into readers' worries about mobile banking data privacy. The goal is to understand how people feel about these digital financial services and what makes them feel safe or unsafe when using them.

According to Akram et al. (2021), the dynamic landscape of technology results in a constant flow of inventions, which in turn brings up a collection of matters that are always developing. Users are reevaluating their faith in mobile banking services as a result of data breaches and privacy concerns, which have become hot-button topics (Shankar et al., 2020). As we traverse this digital terrain, it is becoming increasingly important to deconstruct the intricacies of user concerns and get a knowledge of the elements that impact their view of data privacy in mobile banking.

In this regard, this study aims to bridge the gap between the technological landscape and the human experience. It navigates through the complicated web of user concerns, addressing the fundamental anxieties that go with the suitability of mobile banking. By delving into the qualitative aspects of data privacy, we aim to offer insights into the subtle distinctions that shape user attitudes towards these digital financial tools, leading to following questions:

- i. How do users perceive about the privacy of their data when engaging with mobile banking services?
- ii. What are the key factors influencing user concerns regarding data privacy in the realm of mobile banking in Karachi, Pakistan?

## 2. Review of literature

As part of the process of investigating the multifaceted terrain of data privacy in mobile banking, it is required to begin on a trip through the existing literature in order to get an understanding of the foundations, trends, and gaps that provide the basis for our comprehension. There are a multitude of issues that arise as a result of the combination of technology and finance, and a comprehensive assessment of the pertinent and existing literature offers the relevant contextual framework that is required for our investigation. There has been a substantial shift in the traditional financial landscapes all over the world as a result of the introduction of mobile banking. According to Thusi and Maduku's (2020), the capacity to access financial services at one's fingertips improved in tandem with the widespread adoption of smartphones.

<sup>1</sup> Lecturer, Management Science Department, SBK Women University, Quetta, Pakistan, [nailasbk@gmail.com](mailto:nailasbk@gmail.com)

<sup>2</sup> M. Phil Scholar, Institute of Business Management (IoBM) Karachi, Pakistan, [shama.suleman1357@gmail.com](mailto:shama.suleman1357@gmail.com)

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, University of Turbat, Pakistan, [qayyumbaloch8@yahoo.com](mailto:qayyumbaloch8@yahoo.com)

This progress is highlighted in the literature, which traces the path from the earliest mobile banking solutions to the complex platforms that currently serve as the foundation for our financial interactions (Sharma & Sharma, 2019). In spite of the fact that these services provide a convenient service, they also come with the essential duty of protecting the confidentiality and privacy of user information.

According to Suariedewi et al. (2020), the adoption of mobile banking by customers is closely connected to their trust in the security measures that are taken by financial institutions. Existing research suggests that users are more inclined to adopt these services when they have self-assurance in the security of the system protecting their sensitive data. Several studies have been conducted to investigate the elements that contribute to the formation of trust among users. These aspects include user experience, transparency, and the dependability of security mechanisms (Hanif & Lallie, 2021). Workforce diversity helps intricate better exposure (Khan & Javaid, 2023) and more productive environment (Javaid et al., 2023). Other may influence largely on decision making (Ramzan et al., 2023). The literature emphasizes the indispensable part that trust plays in forming user attitudes.

According to Jouda et al. (2020) research, socio-cultural variables have a key influence in determining how users see the level of data privacy protected by mobile banking services in the setting of Pakistan, and more especially in Karachi. The literature that is currently available acknowledges that cultural variations have an effect on trust-building processes and influence user behaviours. Attitudes in interactions of youngsters change peer relations and impacts on changed aspects of life (Ramzan et al., 2023; Javaid & Mahmood, 2023). According to Sankaran and Chakraborty (2021), research carried out in comparable settings sheds light on the ways in which social norms and values are linked with the acceptance of technology advancements. These studies also provide insights into the specific difficulties and possibilities that are present within the Pakistani scene.

In addition, the literature analysis goes into the convoluted nature of the data privacy risks that are associated with mobile banking operations. According to research conducted in a number of different areas, consumers frequently struggle with concerns over unauthorized access, data breaches, and the inappropriate use of personal information (Wewege et al., 2020). In order to develop strategies and policies that address the complexities of user worries, it is essential to have a thorough understanding of the unique features of these issues in the context of Pakistan.

It becomes clear that the regulatory environment is an key element in the process of assuring the safety of mobile banking transactions. A solid regulatory framework that not only establishes standards for data safety but also infuses trust in users is accentuated in the literature (Chun, 2019). This framework is essential for ensuring effective data protection. Exploring the present regulatory framework in Pakistan, particularly in Karachi, gives useful insights into the processes that are in place and reveals areas where modifications may be required to protection data privacy. Karachi holds a particular significance in this regard.

There is a lot of discussion in the literature about how interface design and user experience may help or hurt data privacy. Apaua and Lallie (2022) state that research is conducted to determine how different design decisions affect user trust and how successful different communication tactics are in relaying the security measures used. If you want to build a mobile banking interface that puts security and functionality first, reading up on the subject is a good place to start.

### **3. Methodology**

In order to explore the complex aspects of data privacy issues within the framework of mobile banking in Karachi, Pakistan, this study utilised a qualitative research approach. An in-depth investigation of the elements that influenced attitudes towards data privacy was made possible through the use of qualitative research methodologies, which were used in order to capture the richness of user experiences and views (Hennink & Kaiser, 2022).

The study's sample of Karachi mobile banking users was representative of the city's population in terms of age, gender, socioeconomic level, and level of education. We used a purposive selection strategy and selected 30 users who have used mobile banking before.

### **4. Data Collection**

Semi-structured in-depth interviews were used to collect thorough information on participants' attitudes and experiences with data privacy in mobile banking. Trust, individual worries, and environmental issues were all intended to be probed by the interview guide. Focus group discussions: These allowed people to voice their opinions in a controlled environment. By using this approach, we were able to delve into people's opinions, find common ground, and identify overarching themes pertaining to data protection.

### **5. Data Analysis**

The qualitative data gathered from interviews and focus groups was analyzed using thematic analysis. Finding, analyzing, and reporting on themes or patterns within the dataset was the goal of the procedure. This approach enabled a detailed examination of user stories, which in turn led to a thorough comprehension of the elements impacting data privacy worries (Vaismoradi & Snelgrove, 2019).

### **6. Ethical Considerations**

Every step of the study procedure was carefully planned to meet ethical issues. Giving participants a thorough rundown of the study's goals, methods, and possible consequences allowed us to get their informed permission, a must for any ethical research. Each participant was asked for their explicit consent before data was collected, confirming that their participation was voluntary. To ensure the privacy of the participants, strict measures were taken to guarantee their anonymity and confidentiality. To ensure that participants could not be identified, any identifying information was deleted from the data and pseudonyms were used. Furthermore, participants were informed that their participation was completely optional, and they were encouraged to resign from the research

at any point without any consequences. The research's credibility and the participants' rights and safety depended on these ethical precautions.

## **7. Rigor and Validity**

A method known as data triangulation was utilized in order to bolster the credibility of the findings. This method involved the utilization of several sources of data, such as interviews and focus group discussions. Furthermore, the preliminary findings were distributed to the participants for the purpose of member verification. This gave the participants the opportunity to validate the interpretations in terms of their correctness and validity. The research procedure was rigorous and valid since the study's methodology and results were peer-reviewed.

## **8. Results**

Findings from the qualitative investigation of mobile banking data privacy in Karachi, Pakistan, were complex and illuminating. We gained a thorough grasp of the elements impacting user perceptions and experiences through thematic analysis of in-depth interviews and focus group discussions.

### **8.1. Trust**

Trust was cited by participants as the most important factor influencing their use of mobile banking services. Their view of the security measures put in place by financial institutions was highly related to their level of trust. Critical components impacting trust include encryption standards, strong authentication mechanisms, and open information regarding security features. Few participants have stated:

Respondent 1: "I take precautions before utilizing mobile banking. The authentication procedure must be robust, you understand? My financial data must be securely safeguarded for me to feel comfortable.

Respondent 2: "Indeed, the bank should demonstrate their commitment to security by taking decisive action." Trust can be built if they are transparent about it and employ cutting-edge encryption.

### **8.2. Socio-Cultural Dynamics**

Data privacy concerns are greatly influenced by socio-cultural dynamics, as shown by the results. Concerns shaped by cultural expectations and norms were often voiced by participants. Participants stressed the importance of cultural norms aligning with mobile banking interfaces to provide a sense of security, especially when it came to financial concerns and privacy. Few participants have stated:

"Privacy is a big deal in our culture," said by one participant. Our money is something we keep under wraps. Our personal information shouldn't feel like it's floating around in cyberspace, and mobile banking should honor that.

"The app should feel familiar, like it understands our way of doing things," said by another participant. Their ability to comprehend and honor our social standards is called into question if it's excessively unfamiliar.

### **8.3. User Experience and Interface Design**

Perceptions of data privacy were shown to be significantly impacted by user experience and interface design, according to the study. Users valued clear and honest communication regarding security features, user-friendly interfaces that stimulate trust, and simple access to privacy preferences. When the interface was well-designed, users had more faith in it, but when it was crowded or difficult to understand, they were wary. Few participants have stated:

"I prefer it when things are straightforward and easy to comprehend," said by a Participant. I start to wonder if there's something they're trying to hide when the app isn't clear. Thanks to the service's clean and user-friendly design, I have more faith in it.

"Open and honest communication is essential," said by a Participant. I feel better about things if they tell me why certain safety measures are in place. They're including me in it, like, in a way.

### **8.4. Impact of Data Breaches on Trust**

The trust that users of the study had in mobile banking was significantly impacted by instances of data breaches that occurred simultaneously on a global and local scale. Users were very sensible of these instances, according to the study, and they affected their propensity to utilize mobile banking services. Restoring self-confidence required open and honest information from monetary institutions regarding the measures taken to deal with data breaches. Few participants of the study have stated:

"Whenever I hear about data breaches, it makes me think twice about using mobile banking," a participant said. Please, bank officials, reassure us and inform us of your efforts to stop this from happening in our area.

According to another Participant: "After a breach, transparency is vital. Warning signs include attempts at concealment or minimization of its seriousness. I would prefer it if they admitted fault and shown they are addressing the issue.

### **8.5. Regulatory Awareness**

The users of the study shown varied degrees of understanding with regard to the regulatory framework that is currently in place for protecting the privacy of data in mobile banking. Participants who have a better level of awareness have indicated a stronger level of trust in the safety of their data, highlighting the need of financial institutions adhering to legislation and providing constant updates. Few participants have stated:

I don't believe many people are aware of the rules," said by a Participant. Plus points if the bank keeps tabs on them and lets us know. It demonstrates that they take the regulations seriously.

According to a Respondent: "The bank needs to stay up with the regulations." 10. Concerningly, they seem to be ignoring the guidelines by not modifying their methods accordingly. Make sure they're keeping in compliance; we demand it.

### **8.6. Perceived Vulnerabilities**

According to the findings of the study, there are some aspects of the mobile banking practice that might be considered susceptible points. A number of possible areas of concern have been highlighted, including authentication procedures, interfaces with third-party applications, and the exchange of personal information for the purpose of providing targeted services. If we want to allay consumer fears, we must first understand these perceived weaknesses. Few users of the study have stated:

Despite the promise of a customized service, a respondent is showed wary of disclosing too much personal information. What if unauthorized individuals were to obtain that information? They must specify precisely why they require it.

Another user raised the issue of authentication. Someone could access everything if they knew my password. The bank must guarantee the process's solidity.

### **8.7. Varied Trust Profiles**

The trust profiles of the users of the study were diverse, reflecting their varied life experiences, degrees of technology literacy, and amount of contact to information. Some customers were very trusting because of their good experiences, while others were wary because of privacy fears and hence avoided using mobile banking services. Few participants have stated:

According to a respondent: "I've heard rumours. Monetary losses or data breaches affecting individuals. It gives me the willies. What I really need is reassurance that my info is secure.

## **9. Discussion**

The conclusions of this study are consistent with and expand upon the findings of earlier studies on the issues of data privacy in mobile banking. In order to get a more thorough grasp of the dynamics that are at play within the environment of Karachi, Pakistan, it is essential to draw linkages and differences.

The focus placed on trust is consistent with the findings of Aldammagh et al. (2021), who highlight the key role that trust plays in determining how users perceive the safety of mobile banking. In line with studies that indicates trust is a fundamental component for user adoption and continuing engagement with digital financial services, this is consistent with the findings. The general significance of building trust in users with regard to the safeguarding of their financial data is reaffirmed by this.

The incorporation of socio-cultural factors into issues over data privacy is in line with Elnaiem (2019), who places an emphasis on the influence that cultural norms have on the development of technology. Not only do the expectations about privacy influenced by Karachi's distinctive cultural values, but the design choices for mobile banking applications are also influenced by these distinctive values. In order to adjust services so that they are in line with the cultural surroundings of the local community, it is essential to recognise and incorporate these subtleties.

It is consistent with Kosim and Legowo (2021) that the study emphasizes the value of user experience and clear communication in alleviating concerns over data protection. The presence of design components that are both clear and intuitive, in combination with open information regarding security measures, has emerged as a factor that influences user trust. Additionally, this lends credence to the idea that the usability of interfaces and the transparency of security features contribute to positive user perceptions.

Consistent with Malaquias and Hwang (2019), consumers' confidence is negatively affected by data breaches. consumers are less likely to utilize digital financial platforms after experiencing security problems. This highlights the importance of strong security measures and good communication by financial institutions following security incidents. Transparency and remedial efforts are crucial in regaining confidence.

This variation in participants' regulatory knowledge is consistent with results from studies conducted in a variety of regional settings (Elhajjar & Ouaida, 2019). This highlights the significance of financial firms aggressively communicating their intention to comply with legislation and also following them. A crucial component in determining how users perceive data security is regulatory awareness, which might vary.

The discovery of particular vulnerabilities is in line with the findings of Suhartanto et al. (2020), who brought attention to user worries over authentication procedures and data exchange. In order for financial institutions to proactively address consumer worries, it is necessary for them to understand these perceived weaknesses. The importance of safe authentication systems, which are crucial for user trust and confidence, is highlighted by the study.

Participant trust profiles are diverse, which is in line with the general consensus that user trust is not a cookie-cutter idea. Different people have different levels of trust depending on things like their own experiences, their level of technical literacy, and the amount of information they've been exposed to (Malaquias and Hwang, 2019). To improve user confidence generally, it is crucial to identify and accommodate these varied trust profiles when developing focused initiatives.

## **10. Conclusions**

Key insights into the elements impacting user perceptions are uncovered by this qualitative examination of data privacy issues in mobile banking among users in Karachi, Pakistan. One of the most important factors is trust, which is closely related to user experience, regulatory knowledge, and socio-cultural dynamics. These findings highlight the need of designing mobile banking services to correspond with local values and preferences, placing an emphasis on honest communication, and continuously adjusting to changing regulatory frameworks. These insights may be utilised by financial institutions in order to strengthen security measures, boost user confidence, and cultivate a digital financial ecosystem in Karachi that is more trustworthy and safer.

### **10.1. Limitations**

Recognizing the study's limits is critical, despite the useful insights obtained. Findings may only be applicable to the particular setting of Karachi due to the qualitative character of the research. It is possible that the sample does not accurately reflect the variety of mobile banking users in the city, and that selection bias had a role in participant recruitment. In addition, the ever-changing nature

of technology brings forth new issues, and the conclusions of the study are a snapshot in time from that moment in time. Despite the fact that these constraints call for a careful interpretation, they also give up opportunities for future study to dive further into the ever-changing environment of data privacy problems in mobile banking.

## References

- Abdelrady, A. H., & Akram, H. (2022). An empirical study of ClassPoint tool application in enhancing EFL students' online learning satisfaction. *Systems, 10*(5), 154.
- Akram, H., & Abdelrady, A. H. (2023). Application of ClassPoint tool in reducing EFL learners' test anxiety: an empirical evidence from Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Computers in Education, 1*-19.
- Akram, H., Yingxiu, Y., Al-Adwan, A. S., & Alkhalifah, A. (2021). Technology integration in higher education during COVID-19: An assessment of online teaching competencies through technological pedagogical content knowledge model. *Frontiers in psychology, 12*, 736522.
- Akram, H., Yingxiu, Y., Aslam, S., & Umar, M. (2021, June). Analysis of synchronous and asynchronous approaches in students' online learning satisfaction during Covid-19 pandemic. In *2021 IEEE International Conference on Educational Technology (ICET)* (pp. 203-207). IEEE.
- Al-Adwan, A. S., Nofal, M., Akram, H., Albelbisi, N. A., & Al-Okaily, M. (2022). Towards a Sustainable Adoption of E-Learning Systems: The Role of Self-Directed Learning. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research, 21*.
- Aldammagh, Z., Abdeljawad, R., & Obaid, T. (2021). Predicting mobile banking adoption: An integration of TAM and TPB with trust and perceived risk. *Financial Internet Quarterly, 17*(3), 35-46.
- Apau, R., & Lallie, H. S. (2022). Measuring User Perceived Security of Mobile Banking Applications. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2201.03052*.
- Audi, M., Ali, A., & Al-Masri, R. (2022). Determinants of Advancement in Information Communication Technologies and its Prospect under the role of Aggregate and Disaggregate Globalization. *Scientific Annals of Economics and Business*.
- Audi, M., Ali, A., & Roussel, Y. (2021). The Advancement in Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) and Economic Development: A Panel Analysis. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change, 15*(4), 1013-1039.
- Chun, S. H. (2019). E-commerce liability and security breaches in mobile payment for e-business sustainability. *Sustainability, 11*(3), 715.
- Elhajjar, S., & Ouaida, F. (2019). An analysis of factors affecting mobile banking adoption. *International Journal of Bank Marketing, 38*(2), 352-367.
- Elnaiem, T. (2019). *The Role of Trust and Gender in Mobile Money Adoption in Lusaka, Zambia: An Analysis Using the Technology Acceptance Model* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Guelph).
- Hanif, Y., & Lallie, H. S. (2021). Security factors on the intention to use mobile banking applications in the UK older generation (55+). A mixed-method study using modified UTAUT and MTAM-with perceived cyber security, risk, and trust. *Technology in Society, 67*, 101693.
- Hennink, M., & Kaiser, B. N. (2022). Sample sizes for saturation in qualitative research: A systematic review of empirical tests. *Social science & medicine, 292*, 114523.
- Javaid, Z. K., & Mahmood, K. (2023). Efficacy of Expressive Writing Therapy in Reducing Embitterment among University Students. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom, 2*(02), 136-145.
- Javaid, Z. K., Andleeb, N., & Rana, S. (2023). Psychological Perspective on Advanced Learners' Foreign Language-related Emotions across the Four Skills. *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies, 3* (2), 191-207.
- Javaid, Z. K., Mahmood, K., & Ali, A. A. (2023). Mediating Role of Mindfulness between Quality of Life and Workplace Stress among Working Women. *Journal of Workplace Behavior, 4*(1), 68-80.
- Javaid, Z.K. & Mahmood, K. (2023). Exploration of Embitterment among University Students: A Qualitative Study. *Journal of Policy Research. 9* (3), 124–129.
- Jouda, H., Abu Jarad, A., Obaid, T., Abu Mdallalah, S., & Awaja, A. (2020, July). Mobile banking adoption: decomposed theory of planned behavior with perceived trust. In *The 1st International Conference on Information Technology & Business ICITB2020*.
- Khan, K., & Javaid, Z. K. (2023). Analyzing Employee Performance through Workforce Diversity Management: Role of Workforce Diversity Characteristics. *Foundation University Journal of Business & Economics, 8*(2), 85-101.
- Kosim, K. P., & Legowo, N. (2021). Factors affecting consumer intention on QR payment of mobile banking: A case study in Indonesia. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, 8*(5), 391-401.
- Malaquias, R. F., & Hwang, Y. (2019). Mobile banking use: A comparative study with Brazilian and US participants. *International Journal of Information Management, 44*, 132-140.
- Ramzan, M., Javaid, Z. K., & Ali, A. A. (2023). Perception of Students about Collaborative Strategies Employed by Teachers for Enhancing English Vocabulary and Learning Motivation. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom, 2*(02), 146-158.
- Ramzan, M., Javaid, Z. K., & Fatima, M. (2023). Empowering ESL Students: Harnessing the Potential of Social Media to Enhance Academic Motivation in Higher Education. *Global Digital & Print Media Review, VI* (II), 224-237.
- Ramzan, M., Javaid, Z. K., & Khan, M. A. (2023). Psychological Discursiveness in Language Use of Imran Khan's Speech on National Issues. *Global Language Review, VIII* (II), 214-225.

- Ramzan, M., Javaid, Z. K., Kareem, A., & Mobeen, S. (2023). Amplifying Classroom Enjoyment and Cultivating Positive Learning Attitudes among ESL Learners. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11 (2), 2298-2308.
- Sankaran, R., & Chakraborty, S. (2021). Factors impacting mobile banking in India: Empirical approach extending UTAUT2 with perceived value and trust. *IIM Kozhikode Society & Management Review*, 11(1), 7-24.
- Shaikh, A. A., & Karjaluoto, H. (2015). Mobile banking adoption: A literature review. *Telematics and informatics*, 32(1), 129-142.
- Shankar, A., Jebarajakirthy, C., & Ashaduzzaman, M. (2020). How do electronic word of mouth practices contribute to mobile banking adoption?. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 52, 101920.
- Sharma, S. K., & Sharma, M. (2019). Examining the role of trust and quality dimensions in the actual usage of mobile banking services: An empirical investigation. *International Journal of Information Management*, 44, 65-75.
- Suariedewi, I. G. A. A. M., & Suprpti, N. W. S. (2020). Effect of mobile service quality to e-trust to develop esatisfaction and e-loyalty mobile banking services. *International Research Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, 7(1), 185-196.
- Suhartanto, D., Dean, D., Ismail, T. A. T., & Sundari, R. (2020). Mobile banking adoption in Islamic banks: Integrating TAM model and religiosity-intention model. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(6), 1405-1418.
- Tam, C., & Oliveira, T. (2017). Literature review of mobile banking and individual performance. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 35(7), 1044-1067.
- Thusi, P., & Maduku, D. K. (2020). South African millennials' acceptance and use of retail mobile banking apps: An integrated perspective. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 111, 106405.
- Vaismoradi, M., & Snelgrove, S. (2019). Theme in qualitative content analysis and thematic analysis.
- Wewege, L., Lee, J., & Thomsett, M. C. (2020). Disruptions and digital banking trends. *Journal of Applied Finance and Banking*, 10(6), 15-56.